INDIANA UNIVERSITY PRESS
OFFICE OF SCHOLARLY PUBLISHING

Cinderella in Africa
Author(s): William Bascom
Source: *Journal of the Folklore Institute*, Vol. 9, No. 1 (Jun., 1972), pp. 54-70
Published by: Indiana University Press
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/3814022
Accessed: 23/06/2014 00:28

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Indiana University Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of the Folklore Institute.*

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

WILLIAM BASCOM

Cinderella in Africa

Three faotors may explain the obvious, if not notorious, anthropological neglect of the tale type indexes and motif indexes, so laboriously compiled and so widely used by other folklorists.[1] In the first place, these indexes are gradually being extended to new areas. In fact, anthropologists have been interested. However, this is no intrinsic shortcoming, and the indexes are gradually being extended to new areas. In fact, anthropologists could well contribute to rectifying this situation by indexing the narratives of the areas of their specialty.

The second factor, which is in part a corollary of the first, is simple ignorance. Anthropologists who publish or interpret folktales are often apparently unaware of the tale type and motif indexes, and of their usefulness in locating analogues in other areas. This again can be remedied by extending the area coverage of the indexes, thus making them more relevant to anthropological interests.

The third factor, I believe, involves a certain skepticism about their basic purpose. According to Stith Thompson,[2] these indexes were prepared primarily to furnish a basis for historic investigations of tales, and the historic-geographic method is the most serious attempt to perfect a technique for such studies. Its goal is "nothing less than a complete life history of a particular tale" including, among other things, its original form and its time and place of origin.

I, for one, am still unwilling to abandon my reservations about the

[1] This paper was delivered at the anual meeting of the American Folklore Societʌ at the Indiana University on November 10, 1968.

[2] Stith Thompson, *The Folktale* (New York: The Dryden Press, 1951), 429-430.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

possibility of recovering the ultimate origins of particular tales – in time and in place – through the historic-geographic method or the use of tale type and motif indexes. However in this paper, which is primarily an exercise in methodology, I will try to show how tale type indexes and motif indexes can answer questions of a more limited time depth, using the Cinderella tale as an example. I believe that the conclusions which I have reached from a quick examination of the relevant tale type indexes are, indeed, conclusive, and that they are confirmed by only a slightly more time-consuming reference to the relevant motif indexes. I would maintain that the only reasonable doubts about these conclusions would be settled if there were complete tale type and motif indexes for Africa.

The tale with which I am concerned is well known to us all as Cinderella, classified according to the Aarne and Thompson index as tale type 510A. My African example appears as Tale 69 in volume two of Frank Edgar's *Litafi Na Tatsuniyoyi Na Hausa. Litafi Na Farako.* Volume two was published in 1911 in Belfast, but all three volumes of this extensive collection remained closed books to folklorists until Neil Skinner, presently of the University of Wisconsin, undertook their translation. I am happy to say that I have had even a minor role in this undertaking. Through Tom Lanagan, one of my students who was studying Hausa under Neil Skinner at UCLA, I suggested the importance of Edgar's collection. Skinner made the translation while he was in New Zealand, completing volume two in 1965. Volume one of Skinner's translation has recently been published by Frank Cass and Company of London as *Hausa Tales and Traditions*, and two others are to follow.

Another, truncated translation of this tale, omitting the hearth abode motif, has appeared in a selection of Hausa tales drawn from Edgar and others by H. A. S. Johnston.[3] Johnston recognized its relation to the Cinderella tale, but reached a different conclusion from the one presented here:

> Another tale in this section, *The Girl and the Frog and the Chief's Son* (no. 31) is strikingly similar to the story of Cinderella. It can hardly be indigenous in origin and the main question is how it reached Hausaland. It may have come from the east, or filtered down through the Sahara, or perhaps even made its way northward from Guinea or Angola after being transported there by the Portuguese. It is worth remembering that whichever route it took, it probably reached Hausaland generations before the first European explorer.[4]

[3] H. A. S. Johnston, *A Selection of Hausa Stories* (Oxford Library of African Literature, 1966), 71-74.
[4] *Ibid.*, xlvii.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

It is precisely with these historical questions that I am concerned; but the evidence presented here, based on tale type and motif indexes and what additional research I have been able to do, leads me to reject Johnston's conclusions about the time and manner of its introduction.

To return to the tale itself, I give you now Skinner's original (draft) translation, which gave rise to this article.

69. *The Maiden, the Frog & the Chief's Son*

There was once a man had two wives, and they each had a daughter. And the one wife, together with her daughter, he couldn't abide; but the other, with her daughter, he dearly loved.

Well, the day came when the wife that he disliked fell ill, and it so happened that her illness proved fatal, and she died. And her daughter was taken over by the other wife, the one he loved; and she moved into that wife's hut. And there she dwelt, having no mother of her own, just her father. And every day the woman would push her out, to go off to the bush to gather wood. When she returned, she had to pound up the *fura*. Then she had the *tuwo* to pound, and, after that, to stir.[5] And then they wouldn't even let her eat the *tuwo*. All they gave her to eat were the burnt bits at the bottom of the pot. And day after day she continued thus.

Now she had an elder brother, and he invited her to come and eat regularly at his home – to which she agreed. But still when she had been to the bush, and returned home, and wanted a drink of water, they wouldn't let her have one. Nor would they give her proper food – only the coarsest of the grindings and the scrapings from the pot. These she would take, and going with them to a borrow-pit, throw them in. And the frogs would come out and start eating the scrapings. Then, having eaten them up, they would go back into the water; and she too would return home.

And so things went on day after day, until the day of the Festival arrived. And on this day, when she went along with the scrapings and coarse grindings, she found a frog squatting there; and realised that he was waiting for her! She got there and threw in the bits of food. Whereupon the frog said "Maiden, you've always been very kind to us, and now we – but just you come along tomorrow morning. That's the morning of the Festival. Come along then, and we'll be kind to you, in our turn." "Fine" said she, and went off home.

Next morning was the Festival, and she was going off to the borrow-pit, just as the frog had told her. But as she was going, her half-sister's mother said to her, "Hey – come here, you good-for-nothing girl! You haven't stirred the *tuwo*, or pounded the *fura*, or fetched the wood or the water." So the girl returned. And the frog spent the whole day waiting for her. But she, having

[5] *Fura* is a kind of gruel and *tuwo* a kind of porridge, both made of millet or other grain; the former is the usual morning meal, the latter the usual evening meal.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

returned to the compound, set off to fetch wood. Then she fetched water, and set about pounding the *tuwo*, and stirred it till it was done and then took it off the fire. And presently she was told to take the scrapings. She did so and went off to the borrow-pit, where she found the frog. "Tut tut, girl" said he, "I've been waiting for you here since morning, and you never came." "Old fellow" said she, "You see, I'm a slave." "How come?" he asked. "Simple" said she, "My mother died – died leaving me her only daughter. I have an elder brother, but he is married and has a compound of his own. And my father put me in the care of his other wife. And indeed he had never loved my mother. So I was moved into the hut of his other wife. And, as I told you, slavery is my lot. Every morning I have to go off to the bush to get wood. When I get back from that I have to pound the *fura*, and then I pound the *tuwo*, and then start stirring it. And even when I have finished stirring the *tuwo*, I'm not given it to eat – just the scrapings." Says the frog, "Girl, give us your hand." And she held it out to him, and they both leaped into the water.

Then he went and picked her up and swallowed her. (And he vomited her up.)[6] "Good people" said he, "Look and tell me, is she straight or crooked?" And they looked and answered, "She is bent to the left." So he picked her up and swallowed her again and then brought her up, and again asked them the same question. "She's quite straight now" they said. "Good" said he.

Next he vomited up cloths for her, and bangles, and rings, and a pair of shoes, one of silver, one of gold. "And now" said he, "Off you go to the dancing." So all these things were given to her, and he said to her "When you get there, and when the dancing is nearly over and the dancers dispersing, you're to leave your golden shoe, the right one, there." And the girl replied to the frog, "Very well, old fellow, I understand," and off she went.

Meanwhile the chief's son had caused the young men and girls to dance for his pleasure, and when she reached the space where they were dancing he saw her. "Well!" said the chief's son, "*There*'s a maiden for you, if you like. Don't you let her go and join in the dancing – I don't care whose home she comes from. Bring her here!" So the servants of the chief's son went over and came back with her to where he was. He told her to sit down on the couch, and she took her seat there accordingly.

They chatted together for some time, till the dancers began to disperse. Then she said to the chief's son, "I must be going home." "Oh, are you off?" said he. "Yes" said she and rose to her feet. "I'll accompany you on your way for a little" said the chief's son, and he did so. But she had left her right shoe behind. Presently she said, "Chief's son, you must go back now," and he did so. And afterwards she too turned and made her way back.

And there she found the frog by the edge of the water waiting for her. He took her hand and the two of them jumped into the water. Then he picked her up and swallowed her, and again vomited her up; and there she was, just as she had been before, a sorry sight. And taking her ragged things she went off home.

[6] Omitted in the Hausa text.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

When she got there, she said, "Fellow-wife of my mother, I'm not feeling very well." And the other said, "Rascally slut! You have been up to no good – refusing to come home, refusing to fetch water or wood, refusing to pound the *fura* or make the *tuwo*. Very well then! No food for you today!" And so the girl set off to her elder brother's compound, and there ate her food, and so returned home again.

But meanwhile the chief's son had picked up the shoe and said to his father, "Dad, I have seen a girl who wears a pair of shoes, one of gold, one of silver. Look, here's the golden one – she forgot it and left it behind. She's the girl I want to marry. So let all the girls of this town, young and old, be gathered together, and let this shoe be given to them to put on." "Very well" said the chief.

And so it was proclaimed, and all the girls, young and old, were collected and gathered together. And the chief's son went and sat there beside the shoe. Each girl came, and each tried on the shoe, but it fitted none of them, none of the girls of the town; until only the girl who had left it was left. Then someone said "Just a minute! There's that girl in so-and-so's compound, whose mother died." "Yes, that's right," said another, "Someone go and fetch her." And someone went and fetched her.

But the minute she arrived to try it on, the shoe itself of its own accord, ran across and made her foot get into it. Then said the chief's son, "Right, here's my wife."

At this, the other woman – the girl's father's other wife – said, "But the shoe belongs to my daughter; it was she who forgot it at the place of the dancing, not this good-for-nothing slut." But the chief's son insisted that, since he had seen the shoe fit the other girl, as far as he was concerned, she was the one to be taken to his compound in marriage. And so they took her there, and there she spent one night.

Next morning she went out of her hut and round behind it, and there saw the frog. She knelt respectfully and said, "Welcome, old fellow, welcome" and greeted him. Says he, "Tonight we shall be along to bring some things for you." "Thank you" said she, and he departed.

Well, that night, the frog rallied all the other frogs, and all his friends, both great and small came along. And he, their leader, said to them, "See here – my daughter is being married. So I want every one of you to make a contribution." And each of them went and fetched what he could afford, whereupon their leader thanked them all, and then vomited up a silver bed, a brass bed, a copper bed, and an iron bed. And went on vomiting up things for her – such as woollen blankets, and rugs, and satins, and velvets.

"Now" said he to the girl, "If your heart is ever troubled, just lie down on this brass bed" and he went on, "And when the chief's son's other wives come to greet you, give them two calabashes of cola-nuts and ten thousand cowrie shells; then, when his concubines come to greet you, give them one calabash of cola-nuts and five thousand cowries." "Very well" said she. Then he said, "And when the concubines come to receive corn for making *tuwo*, say to them,

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

'There's a hide-bag full, help yourselves'." "Very well" she said. "And" he went on, "If your father's wife comes along with her daughter and asks you what it is like living in the chief's compound, say 'Living in the chief's compound is a wearisome business – for they measure out corn there with the shell of a Bambara groundnut'."

So there she dwelt, until one day her father's favourite wife brought her daughter along at night, took her into the chief's compound, and brought the other girl out and took her to her own compound. There she said, "Oh! I forgot to get you to tell her all about married life in the chief's compound." "Oh, it's a wearisome business" answered our girl. "How so?" asked the older woman, surprised. "Well, they use the shell of a Bambara groundnut for measuring out corn. Then, if the chief's other wives come to greet you, you answer them with the 'Pf' of contempt. If the concubines come to greet you, you clear your throat, hawk, and spit. And if your husband comes into your hut, you yell at him." "I see" said the other – and her daughter stayed behind in the chief's son's compound.

Next morning when it was light, the wives came to greet her – and she said "Pf" to them. The concubines came to greet her, and she spat at them. Then when night fell, the chief's son made his way to her hut, and she yelled at him. And he was amazed and went aside, and for two days pondered the matter.

Then he had his wives and concubines collected and said to them, "Look, now – I've called you to ask you. They haven't brought me the same girl. How did that one treat all of you?" "Hm – how indeed!" they all exclaimed. "Each morning, when we wives went to greet her, she would give us cola-nuts, two calabashes full, and cowries, ten thousand of them to buy tobacco flowers. And when the concubines went to greet her, she would give them a calabash of cola-nuts, and five thousand cowries to buy tobacco flowers with; and in the evening, for corn for *tuwo*, it would be a whole hide-bag full." "You see?" said he, "As for me, whenever I came to enter her hut, I found her respectfully kneeling. And she wouldn't get up from there, until I had entered and sat down on the bed."

"Hey" he called out, "Boys, come over here!" And when they came, he went into her hut and took a sword, and chopped her up into little pieces, and had them collect them and wrap them up in clothing; and then taken back to her home.

And when they got there, they found his true wife lying in the fireplace, and picking her up they took her back to her husband.

And next morning when it was light, she picked up a little gourd water-bottle and going around behind her hut, there saw the frog. "Welcome, welcome, old fellow" said she, and went on, "Old fellow, what I should like is to have a well built; and then you, all of you, can come and live in it and be close to me." "All right" said the frog, "You tell your husband." And she did so.

And he had a well dug for her, close to her hut. And the frogs came and entered the well and there they lived. That's all. *Kungurus kan kusu.*

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

This tale, first published more than half a century ago, obviously has many elements which are strange to us. Most of them, including *fura*, *tuwo*, cowrie shells, cola-nuts, Bambara groundnuts, plural wives and concubines, and the Hausa closing formula are clearly derived from Africa, where it was recorded. Nevertheless, I believe that you should be able to recognize it as the Cinderella tale familiar to us from our childhood. In terms of Aarne and Thompson's synopsis of the combined Cinderella/Cap o' Rushes type 510,[7] we can see the following similarities:

I. *The persecuted heroine.* (a) The heroine is abused by her stepmother.

II. *Magic help.* While she is acting as a servant at home, she is fed by her brother and magically provided for by a frog. The identity of the helpful characters differs from those in the tales considered by Aarne and Thompson, where she is fed by (a) her dead mother, (b) a tree on the mother's grave, (c) a supernatural being, (d) birds, or (e) a goat, a sheep, or a cow. Nevertheless we know that characters are easily substituted in folktales, as is obvious from this variant.

III. *Meeting the prince.* She goes to a dance dressed in beautiful clothing, including a slipper of gold, and a slipper of silver. She meets the son of a chief (the prince) and as she goes home, she leaves behind her golden slipper, which the prince finds. (Cf. elements a and c).

IV. *Proof of identity.* (a) She is discovered through the slipper-test.

V. *Marriage with the prince.* She marries the son of the chief.

VI. *Value of salt.* This element is replaced by an episode in which she is displaced by her stepsister, who is eventually discovered and killed. Our heroine is then discovered lying in the fireplace (Cf. I.a′), and is taken back to her husband, the prince.

Certainly not all of the elements mentioned in Aarne and Thompson's synopsis of tale type 510 are present in the Hausa tale, but neither are they all present in each of the tales on which the synopsis is based. Despite its omissions, despite its very different conclusion, and despite its presumably African accretions, such as the vomiting frog, this to me is clearly a Cinderella tale.

What I am concerned with here is the question of (1) whether this tale was introduced into northern Nigeria in the relatively recent period since European contact, or (2) whether it spread southward across the Sahara

[7] Antti Aarne and Stith Thompson, *The Types of the Folktale* (= *FF Communications* no. 184, 1964), 175-176.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

by diffusion in earlier times. Conversely, (3) is this an indigenous tale which originated in Africa and spread from there to Europe and Asia? Alternatively, (4) does it represent an example of independent invention?

Beyond this, I am interested in finding how useful tale type indexes and motif indexes can be to folklorists in answering such questions, which involve a far more limited time scale than the studies for which they were compiled. All of these questions can be answered quickly.

First, we look at tale types 510, 510A, and 510B in Aarne and Thompson's *The Types of the Folktale*. Here we find references to over a thousand examples from Europe and Asia, eighty-seven from Euro-American sources, thirty-five from the West Indies (Negro), and one from the American Indians. None are cited for Africa.

Next we look at Klipple's "African Folk Tales with Foreign Analogues".[8] If an African Cinderella tale were known thirty years ago it should be here, because Klipple was expressly concerned with African tales which had counterparts in European tradition. We find no entries under tale type numbers 510, 510A, or 510B.

Since a considerable amount of African folklore has been published since 1938, we may look next at the regional tale type indexes for East Africa by E. Ojo Arewa[9] and for Central Africa by Winifred Lambrecht.[10] Again there are no entries for tale type numbers 510, 510A, or 510B.

On the basis of a quick check of these four tale type indexes alone it seems reasonable to conclude that the Cinderella tale had not diffused across the Sahara from Europe to Nigeria, or from Nigeria to Europe, and that it was not invented independently by the Hausa, because no other African examples are reported. We can conclude then that this tale must have been introduced since European contact, perhaps during the decade between Lugard's entry into Kano and Sokoto in 1903 and the publication of the tale in 1911, or possibly by earlier missionaries or explorers like Clapperton and Barth in the previous century.

Next we may turn to the motif indexes and to the motifs of tale types

[8] May Augusta Klipple, "African Folk Tales with Foreign Analogues" (doctoral dissertation in English, Indiana University, 1938).

[9] E. Ojo Arewa, "A Classification of the Folktales of the Northern East African Cattle Area by Types" (doctoral dissertation in anthropology, University of California, Berkeley, 1966).

[10] Winifred Lambrecht, "A Tale Type Index for Central Africa" (doctoral dissertation in anthropology, University of California, Berkeley, 1967).

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

510, 510A, and 510B. For this purpose we have, first of all, Stith Thompson's *Motif-Index of Folk-Literature* in six volumes. We also have Kenneth W. Clarke's motif index for West Africa,[11] and the list of East African motifs included in Arewa's study.

Two motifs of the Cinderella tale, cruel stepmother (L55) and stepdaughter heroine (S31) are listed by Arewa; both are found together in the same two Rundi tales. Cruel stepmother is also reported by Clarke and by Thompson for three additional African tales, from Togo, from Cameroun, and from the Ikom of Nigeria. Motif L162, lowly heroine marries prince, appears in one Swahili tale cited by Arewa.

On the other hand, no African examples of the following motifs are cited in any of these three indexes:

Abused youngest daughter (L52)
Cruel stepsister (S34)
Hearth abode of unpromising hero (heroine) (L131)
Supernatural helpers (N810)
Clothes produced by magic (D1050.1)
Golden shoes (F823.1)
Glass shoes (F823.2)
Silver shoes (F823.4)
Carriage from pumpkin (F861.4.3)
Magic animal supplies treasure (B100.2)
Prince sees heroine at ball and is enamored (N711.6)
Tabu: staying too long at ball. Must leave before certain hour (C761.3)
Slipper test (H36.1)
False bride's mutilated feet (K1911.3.3.1)
Girl hacks off her heel to get shoe on (J2131.3.1).

Golden slippers are of course common in the European Cinderella tradition, and they appear in the tale from Malagasy to be referred to later. In the Grimms' version silk and silver slippers are worn on the first visit to the festival and golden slippers on the third.

No African examples are reported for animal spitting (vomiting) treasure (B103.4), but helpful frog (B493.1) is cited by Thompson for the Zulu, Ronga, and Suto; by Clarke for Togo; and by Arewa for the Safwa and Gogo, making six instances in all. Moreover, in a Swazi tale a helpful

[11] Kenneth W. Clarke, "A Motif-Index of the Folktales of Culture Area V, West Africa" (doctoral dissertation in folklore, Indiana University, Bloomington, 1957).

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

frog saves the heroine by swallowing her and then bringing her up again,[12] and two girls are saved in a similar fashion in a Konde tale.[13] Again in a Lamba tale a helpful frog saves a brother and sister by swallowing them, taking them home, and belching them up.[14] Thompson also reports the helpful frog motif for Jewish folklore and for India, China, and Chile as well; but it is clear that it is widely distributed in Africa, and was probably added to this tale in Nigeria. In another Hausa tale, a mother makes her ugly daughter beautiful by swallowing her and bringing her up again.[15]

The examination of the relevant motif indexes gives us no reason to modify the conclusions which were reached by very quick references to four tale type indexes. In fact, it tends to confirm them.

However, we have a third check, since the Cinderella tale has been subjected to two intensive, comparative studies. Marian Cox's early study of *Cinderella*[16] cites four African tales, but none for the Cinderella tale type (510A). One from Mauritius (Cox no. 145) she classifies as a Catskin tale; because of the heroine's flight from her lecherous father who has promised her dresses like the sun, the moon, and the stars if she will marry him, it belongs to type 510B, Cap o' Rushes, or The Dress of Gold, of Silver, and of Stars.[17] One from Egypt and another from South Africa (Cox nos. 337, 339), she classes as "Hero-Tales" (a hero replaces the heroine). The Hero-Tales have some incidents which are found "in stories of the 'Cinderella' type", and Cox includes them "merely for purposes of comparison, as it seemed inadvisable to pass them over entirely." A Kabyle tale, which belongs somewhere in the type 511 series, is considered only in a footnote to no. 29. None of these four tales involves a dance or a slipper-test, and none of them resembles the Hausa tale with which we are concerned.

For the purpose of making historic-geographical studies of the

[12] E. J. Bourhill and J. B. Drake, *Fairy Tales from South Africa* (London: Macmillan and Company, 1908), 187-197.

[13] Friedrich Fülleborn, *Das Deutsche Njassa- und Ruwuma-gebiet, Land und Leute* (= *Deutsch-Ost-Afrika*, vol. 9) (1906), 334.

[14] Clement M. Doke, *Lamba Folk-Lore* (= *Memoir of the American Folk-Lore Society*, vol. 20) (1927), 247-249.

[15] A. J. N. Tremearne, *Hausa Superstitions and Customs* (London: John Bale, Sons and Danielsson, 1913), 304.

[16] Marian Roalfe Cox, *Cinderella* (= *Publications of the Folk-Lore Society*, vol. 31) (1893).

[17] Anna Birgitta Rooth, *The Cinderella Cycle* (Lund: C.W.K.Gleerup, 1951), 115, concludes that this tale, recorded by Baissac, is derived from Perrault.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Cinderella tale it may be necessary to group types 510A and 510B together, since in some narratives they are combined. But in trying to answer the kind of questions I have asked about the Hausa Cinderella tale, types 510B, 511, and the "Hero-Tales" can be disregarded unless they have more in common than a cruel stepmother. Both Cox and Rooth cite tales which are otherwise completely different.[18]

Anna Birgitta Rooth's *The Cinderella Cycle*[19] is an extension and amplification of Cox's study. She reports that only five examples of tale type 510A have been found outside Europe: from Martinique in the New World, from India and Arabia, and from Egypt and Malagasy.

The Malagasy tale consists of two parts, the second of which is clearly the Cinderella tale, complete with cruel stepsisters, a rat that produces fine clothes and golden slippers, three visits to a dance, a prince who dances only with the heroine, her hurried return home at midnight, the slipper left at the dance, the slipper-test, and marriage to the prince. Ferrand,[20] who noted its similarity to the Cinderella tale, reported that the aged Antambahoaka informant who dictated it to him was completely illiterate, that he had known it since childhood, and that his statements were confirmed by other Antambahoaka. This is undoubtedly true of the first part of the tale, since it has been recorded by Renel among the Tanala of Malagasy.[21] However, I would agree with Rooth that the Cinderella portion is obviously of French origin. She believes that the heroine's name, Sandroy, is in imitation of the French Cendron or Cendrillion; and I consider it significant that, in the middle of the narrative, her name is changed to Sandroy from Fara, and that Ifara or Ifaravavy is the heroine's name in the Tanala tale.

The Egyptian tale[22] involves jealous sisters, an enchanted pot which provides food and beautiful clothing, a party at the king's palace, a

[18] For example, E. J. Bourhill and J. B. Drake, *Fairy Tales from South Africa* (London, 1908), 139-150, 198-211.

[19] *Op. cit.*

[20] Gabriel Ferrand, *Contes populaires Malgaches* (= *Collection de contes et chansons populaires*, vol. 19) (1893), 123-129.

[21] Charles Renel, *Contes de Madagascar*, I (= *Collection de contes et chansons populaires*, vol. 37) (1910), 154-160.

[22] S. E. Yacoub Artin Pacha, *Contes populaires de la Vallée de Nil* (= *Les littératures populaires de toutes les nations*, vol. 32) (1895), 63-67. I have been unable to locate a second Egyptian tale referred to by Rooth as from Østrup, or a "Yumale" tale from "innerafrika" mentioned by Bolte and Polívka. However all other "Cinderella" tales cited for Africa have been examined.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

diamond bracelet dropped as the heroine hastens home, and a bracelet-test. The marriage to the prince follows an episode in which the heroine is transformed into a turtle dove and then released from her spell. This differs considerably from the Hausa tale, but let us accept it as a Cinderella variant.

Among the references to her type B (510A), Rooth[23] cites a Mande tale published by Frobenius.[24] In it a girl is made to sort grain before her cruel stepmother lets her go to a dance; but by the time she gets there the dance is finished, and there is no prince, no slipper-test, and no wedding.

Rooth also cites Chatelain's tale from Angola as involving tale type 510A. Of it Chatelain himself said, "This story is originally that of the 'Cenerentola', the universality of which has been traced up by Gubernatis in his 'Florilegio delle novelline populari', p. 5, and by Henry Chasle Coste. In the folklore of Portugal, Madeira, and Brazil it is current under various names and in various versions."[25] The evidence presented here challenges the notion that Cenerentola (Cinderella) is a universal tale; and, if Chatelain's example is really part of the Cinderella tradition, it is highly garbled and probably derived from the Portugese. It involves a cruel sister-in-law, a helpful goat, a helpful old woman who gives Maria magical boxes which produce clothes, a carriage and attendants, a meeting with the Governor in church, and an announcement that the Governor will reward anyone who can take off "only a shoe" from the still unidentified Maria. But shoes or slippers are not mentioned again, and the tale ends with Maria's brother leaving his wife and returning to live with his sister. Klipple must have known of this tale since it was published in the American Folklore Society's Memoir, no. 1; but apparently she did not consider it closely enough related to the Cinderella tale to mention it in her index.

Over half a century ago Tremearne noted that "Cinderella was not the only one who had shoes which would fit no one but her."[26] In view of the tale in the Edgar collection, it would not be surprising to find another

[23] Rooth, *The Cinderella Cycle*, 251.

[24] Leo Frobenius, *Erzählungen aus dem West Sudan* (= *Atlantis*, vol. 8) (1922), 163-165.

[25] Heli Chatelain, *Folk-Tales of Angola* (= *Memoirs of the American Folk-Lore Society*, vol. 1) (1894), 265.

[26] A. J. N. Tremearne, *Hausa Superstitions and Customs* (London: John Bale, Sons and Danielsson, 1913), 14.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Hausa version of the Cinderella tale; and, if there were no others, it would suggest that Edgar's tale was a recent introduction. However, in the Hausa tale to which Tremearne referred, a boot-test identifies a boy hero who has slain a monster by throwing hot stones into its mouth, after he has disposed of his and his sister's slaves, burned all their property, killed the sons of a king, and wounded a bird that has saved him and his sister.[27] In an Egyptian version of this tale, the boy's sister is identified by a dropped sandal, but without having to fit her foot into it; the boy hero in this tale burns all their property, burns the houses of their neighbors, kills the children of a king, tickles a bird that has saved him and his sister, and destroys a monster by throwing burning stones into its mouth.[28] Similarly in the course of a series of adventures in a Fulani tale[29] and in two versions of a Kabyle tale[30] a man is identified by a boot-test as the hero who has killed a crocodile or a snake that kept people from taking water from a river. There is also a Yoruba tale in which a man is identified by a boot-test as the hero who has slain a giant eagle that had been killing people.[31] Motifs suggestive of the slipper-test are incorporated into what are clearly other tale types, distinct from Cinderella.

Because neither the tale type nor its significant motifs, except for the helpful frogs (who are not part of the European Cinderella tale) and the cruel stepmother, have been reported for any of the Hausa's neighbors or for the huge areas which separate Nigeria from Europe, Egypt, and Malagasy, we may safely conclude that this tale did not reach the Hausa by diffusion from these places. And for the very same reasons we may conclude that it did not diffuse to them from Nigeria.

As Daniel Crowley has noted, there are many African tales which have been reported in only one instance, from a single society; but it is most unlikely that the Hausa Cinderella tale represents an instance of independent invention because it contains so many, and such specific, elements that are common to its European counterparts. Again we are left with

[27] *Ibid.*, 410-412.

[28] Artin Pacha, 149-156.

[29] F. V. Equilbecq, *Essai sur la littérature merveilleuse des noirs, suivi des contes indigènes de l'ouest africain français*, II (= *Collection de contes et chansons populaires*, vol. 42) (1915), 3-42.

[30] Leo Frobenius, *Volksmärchen der Kabylen*, vol. 2 (= *Atlantis*, vol. 2) (1922), 71-90.

[31] Abayomi Fuja, *Fourteen Hundred Cowries* (London: Oxford University Press, 1962), 24-30.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

the first of our four alternatives, that the Hausa Cinderella tale, like the Malagasy one, was introduced in the recent period of European contact.

Negative evidence is not very convincing, and it is of course possible that the conclusions I have reached may have to be modified when a tale type index for all of Africa has been completed; but I consider this relatively unlikely. Even though the available indexes are incomplete, I believe that I have been able to show that tale type and motif indexes can be useful to folklorists by providing quick answers to some questions of restricted time depth.

I imply no criticism of any of the authors of the tale type and motif indexes or of the comparative studies that I have cited for having failed to find the Hausa Cinderella tale or its motifs, such as the slipper-test, in Africa. Many of them deliberately excluded Malagasy and Egypt from their studies and, as I indicated earlier, Edgar's collection of Hausa tales was a closed book to scholars until Neil Skinner made it available to us in translation. Because he has done folklorists such a great service, I hope that he will not take offense at the final point I wish to make about the Hausa Cinderella tale.

This point is that, however well one may understand a language and however skillful he may be in the very difficult art of translation, he may miss some of the meaning of folktales unless he has a general knowledge of folklore, or at least takes the little time that is required to consult the tale type indexes. When Skinner first sent me a photocopy of his draft translation of Edgar's volume two, there was a marginal notation at the point in the tale where the heroine is found "lying in the fireplace". In this note he asks, "Why? For warmth, as she wasn't allotted a hut?"

The answer, of course, is that this is Motif L131, "Hearth abode of unpromising hero (heroine)" and point I.a′ in the Aarne-Thompson synopsis of tale type 510, "The heroine ... stays on the hearth or in the ashes." It is also the source of the heroine's name, Cinder-Ella.

Postscript. After this paper was delivered, Daniel Crowley kindly sent me abstracts of additional tales related to Cinderella made by his students in connection with his work on a tale type index for Africa. Among them were the Equilbecq and Frobenius tales of the hero identified by a boot-test which I have cited above, and a version of the Cinderella tale which is not mentioned in the tale type or motif indexes or in the studies of the Cinderella tale type. I have decided to append it here rather than in-

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

corporate it in the earlier discussion, since this is primarily an essay on methodology. The tale comes from Marrakech in Morocco[32] and combines what I would consider to be three tale types: A, A stepdaughter is cared for by a dead cow (her mother); B, Cinderella; and C, The heroine is saved after having been pushed into a well by her stepsister. Both A and C have been recorded elsewhere in Africa, but we are concerned with B.

A. A man has two wives. One is beautiful and has a beautiful daughter; the other is wicked and ugly and has an ugly daughter. The ugly wife transforms the beautiful wife into a cow, makes the beautiful daughter do all the work in the kitchen, throws ashes in the girls hair, and names her "Soiled with Ashes". The cow-mother cleans away the ashes and caresses her child, but the ugly stepmother has the cow sold and butchered. The beautiful daughter gathers the cow's bones, washes them and buries them. The cow-mother returns nightly from the grave to clean and care for her child.

B. The king announces a feast to celebrate his marriage. The ugly stepmother prepares her own daughter and sends her to the feast, leaving the grain. Before the feast ends, the cow-mother cleans her daughter, dresses her in beautiful garments, puts tiny slippers on her feet, and carries her to the feast where she dazzles all with her beauty. Birds sort the grain. Before the feast ends, the cow-mother carries her daughter home, but the girl loses one of her slippers. The king sends his fiancée away, announcing that he will marry only the woman whose foot fits the slipper that has been found. After searching the kingdom, only the girl's house is left. The stepsister's feet are too big for the slipper; a cock tells of "Soiled with Ashes" hiding in the kitchen; the slipper fits on her foot, matching the slipper on the other. The king marries her immediately.

C. The new queen receives her stepmother and stepsister in the palace and gives them presents; but one day her stepsister pushes her into the well. The stepmother magically transforms her daughter so that she looks like the queen, but she repulses the king when he returns from battle. The king sends for water from the well, finds his wife with his new-born child alive in the well, and they are rescued. The stepsister is killed and her body is sent to the stepmother, who eats it, thinking it is a gift from her daughter.

[32] Françoise Légey, *Contes et légendes populaires de Maroc* (= *Publications de l'Institut des Hautes Études Marocaines*, vol. 16) (1926), 19-23.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Here, at the opposite end of the Mediterranean littoral from Egypt, we have the motifs of the cruel stepmother, grain sorting, garments magically provided, the feast (dance), the lost slipper and the slipper-test, the heroine soiled with ashes and found hidden in the kitchen, and a marriage to a king. In retrospect, my earlier statements sound rather dogmatic; but on the basis of this one instance I do not feel compelled to change my conclusion about the origin of the Hausa Cinderella tale. The three other African versions of Cinderella are all from the coastal regions of Africa, and Marrakech, like Egypt, is close to Europe.

However, the Marrakech example underscores the importance of completing a tale type index for Africa. Both Cox and Rooth consider African tales of a helpful cow, similar to Part A, but neither cites the one from Marrakech.

I cannot conclude without remarking that only four Cinderella tales for the large area of Africa, generously defined, is a surprisingly small number, considering that the long period of European contact involved both colonial rule and European controlled schools. In his introduction to Cox's *Cinderella*, Andrew Lang observed, "One thing is plain, a naked and a shoeless race could not have invented Cinderella."[33] It is also likely that the absence of shoes in much of the African continent has been a cultural barrier to the adoption of a tale which hinges on a slipper-test. Nevertheless this small total lends little support to the contention that tales of European (or Indian) origin were adopted by Africans, quickly and in large numbers, during the early period of the slave trade. Furthermore, I must agree with what Crowley has said elsewhere: that it is not easy to conceive of the slave traders spending their evenings beguiling their African chattels with folktales.

Admittedly, it is also difficult to imagine Lugard's officers and administrators beguiling their subjects with evenings of telling folktales, especially during the first years of their occupation of northern Nigeria. However, a number of early administrators – including Edgar himself – and missionaries and others did actually record and publish folktales.[34]

[33] *Op. cit.*, x.

[34] This includes the following, listed in chronological order:

J. F. Schön, *Grammar of the Hausa Language* (London: Church Missionary House, 1862), xiv, viii, 234.

J. F. Schön. *Dictionary of the Hausa Language* (London: Church Missionary House, 1876), 218, 142, xxxxiv.

J. F. Schön, *Hausa Reading Book, with the Rudiments of Grammar and Voca-*

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

It is by no means inconceivable that one or more of these individuals told the Cinderella story in order to elicit Hausa folktales from their informants. In fact, Schön says of his fifth tale, "This Story was told to some children in English, and related by Dorugu in Hausa."[35] At this date the evidence is only circumstantial, but both opportunity and motive were present.

University of California
Berkeley, California

---

bularies, and Traveller's Vade Mecum (London: Church Missionary Society, 1877), viii, 102.

J. F. Schön, *Magána Hausa* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1885-86), 2 vols., xx, 288; xii, 195.

J. F. Schön, *Appendix to the Dictionary of the Hausa Language* (London: Church Missionary Society, 1888), iv, 206.

A. Dirr, *Manuel pratique de langue haoussa* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1895), 140.

C. H. Robinson, *Specimens of Hausa Literature* (Cambridge: University Press, 1896), xix, 112.

C. H. Robinson, *Hausa Grammar, with Exercises, Readings, and Vocabulary* (London: Kegan Paul, 1897). [Second edition: 1905, vii, 210.]

Gottlob Adolf Krause, "Beiträge zum Märchenschatz der Afrikaner", *Globus* 72 (1897): 228-33, 254-58.

E. C. Marré, *Die Sprache der Hausa* (= *Die Kunst der Polyglottie*, vol. 70) (1901), x, 176.

A. Mischlich, *Lehrbuch der hausanische Sprache* (*Hausa Sprache*) (= *Archiv für das Studium deutscher Kolonialsprachen*, vol. 1) (1902), x, 184.

J. Lippert, "Haussa-Märchen", *Mitteilungen des Seminars für orientalische Sprachen*, Dritte Abteilung: *Afrikanische Studien* 8 : 3 (1905): 223-250.

Rudolf Prietze, "Tiermärchen der Haussa", *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie* 39, (1907): 916-939.

L. E. O. Charlton, *A Hausa Reading Book* (London: Oxford University Press, 1908), 83, 45.

Hermann G. Harris, *Hausa Stories and Riddles* (Weston-super-Mare, England: Mendip Press, 1908), xv, 111.

M. Landeroin and J. Tilho, *Grammaire et contes haoussas* (Paris: Imprimerie Nationale, 1909), xii, 292.

A. J. N. Tremearne, "Some Specimens of Hausa Folklore", *Journal of the Royal Society of Arts* 58 (1909-10): 1061-1068.

A. J. N. Tremearne, "Fifty Hausa Folk-Tales", *Folk-Lore* 21 (1910): 199-215, 351-65, 487-503; 22 (1911): 60-73, 218-28, 341-48, 457-73.

A. J. N. Tremearne, "Hausa Folk-Lore", *Man* 11 (1911): 20-23, 52-58.

Mary and Newmann Tremearne, *Fables and Fairy Tales for Little Folk, or Uncle Remus in Hausaland* (Cambridge: Heffer and Sons, 1910), 135.

Diedrich Westermann, *Die Sprache der Haussa in Zentralafrika* (= *Deutsche Kolonialsprachen*, vol. 3) (1911), viii, 88.

[35] J. F. Schön, *Grammar of the Hausa Language* (London: Church Missionary House, 1862), 189.

This content downloaded from 195.78.109.119 on Mon, 23 Jun 2014 00:28:05 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions